

## ความพึงพอใจของผู้บังคับบัญชาที่มีต่อประสิทธิภาพการปฏิบัติงาน ของบัณฑิต มหาวิทยาลัยสงขลานครินทร์ วิทยาเขตปัตตานี

ชิตชนก เชิงเขาว<sup>1</sup>, วิธาดา สิ้นประจักษ์ผล<sup>2</sup> และสุวิมล เขี้ยวแก้ว<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Ph.D.(Educational Research and Testing), รองศาสตราจารย์,

E-mail: cchidcha@bunga.pn.psu.ac.th

ภาควิชาประเมินผลและวิจัยทางการศึกษา

<sup>2</sup>Ed.D.(Reading), ผู้ช่วยศาสตราจารย์,

<sup>3</sup>Ph.D.(Curriculum and Instruction, Science Education), รองศาสตราจารย์,

ภาควิชาการศึกษา คณะศึกษาศาสตร์ มหาวิทยาลัยสงขลานครินทร์

### บทคัดย่อ

การวิจัยเรื่องนี้มีวัตถุประสงค์เพื่อ ศึกษาความพึงพอใจของผู้บังคับบัญชาที่มีต่อประสิทธิภาพการปฏิบัติงานของบัณฑิต มหาวิทยาลัยสงขลานครินทร์ วิทยาเขตปัตตานี กลุ่มตัวอย่างเป็นผู้บังคับบัญชา จำนวน 127 คน ของบัณฑิตที่สำเร็จการศึกษาระหว่างปีการศึกษา 2544 - 2545 ซึ่งมีสถานที่ทำงานตั้งอยู่ในจังหวัดภาคใต้ตอนบน ภาคใต้ตอนล่าง กรุงเทพมหานคร และปริมณฑล เครื่องมือที่ใช้ คือ แบบสอบถาม และแบบสัมภาษณ์ สำหรับการวิเคราะห์ข้อมูลเชิงปริมาณใช้วิธีหาค่าความถี่ ร้อยละ ค่าเฉลี่ย และส่วนเบี่ยงเบนมาตรฐาน สำหรับการวิเคราะห์ข้อมูลเชิงคุณภาพใช้วิธีวิเคราะห์เนื้อหา ผลการวิจัยพบว่าความพึงพอใจของผู้บังคับบัญชาที่มีต่อประสิทธิภาพการ

ปฏิบัติงานของบัณฑิตมหาวิทยาลัยสงขลานครินทร์ วิทยาเขตปัตตานี ในด้านคุณลักษณะพื้นฐานอยู่ในระดับสูง ( $\bar{X} = 3.92$ ) ด้านคุณลักษณะทางสังคม อยู่ในระดับสูง ( $\bar{X} = 4.08$ ) ด้านคุณลักษณะทางวิชาชีพ อยู่ในระดับสูง ( $\bar{X} = 4.01$ ) และด้านคุณลักษณะทางเขาวนอารมณ์อยู่ในระดับสูง ( $\bar{X} = 3.97$ ) โดยภาพรวมของความพึงพอใจของผู้บังคับบัญชาอยู่ในระดับสูงเช่นกัน ( $\bar{X} = 4.00$ ) สำหรับข้อเสนอแนะที่ได้รับมากที่สุดในการปรับปรุงประสิทธิภาพการทำงานของบัณฑิตด้านคุณลักษณะพื้นฐาน คือ ควรเสริมความกระตือรือร้นให้มากขึ้น ด้านคุณลักษณะทางสังคม คือ ควรเปิดกว้างยอมรับความคิดเห็นของผู้อื่น ด้านคุณลักษณะทางวิชาชีพ คือ ควรเอาใจใส่ต่อหน้าที่การงานอย่างเต็มกำลังความสามารถ และด้านคุณลักษณะทางเขาวนอารมณ์ คือ ควรควบคุมอารมณ์ตนเองให้มากขึ้น ข้อเสนอแนะของการวิจัย คือ มหาวิทยาลัยควรนำผลการวิจัยไปเป็นแนวทางในการปรับปรุงหลักสูตรและโครงการต่าง ๆ ในการพัฒนานักศึกษา เพื่อให้บัณฑิตมีคุณภาพสอดคล้องกับความต้องการของตลาดแรงงานต่อไป

คำสำคัญ: ความพึงพอใจ, ประสิทธิภาพการปฏิบัติงาน, ผู้บังคับบัญชา, บัณฑิตมหาวิทยาลัยสงขลานครินทร์

## Superiors' Satisfaction with the Efficiency of Work Performance of Graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus

Chidchanok Churngchow<sup>1</sup>, Withada Sinprajukpol<sup>2</sup> and Suwimon Kiokaew<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Ph.D.(Educational Research and Testing), Associate Professor,

Department of Educational Evaluation and Research,

E-mail: cchidcha@bunga.pn.psu.ac.th

<sup>2</sup>Ed.D.(Reading), Assistant Professor,

<sup>3</sup>Ph.D. Curriculum and Instruction (Science Education), Associate Professor,

Department of Education,

Faculty of Education, Prince of Songkla University

### Abstract

The objective of this research project was to study the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus. The sample consisted of 127 superiors of graduates during the 2001-2002 academic years whose workplaces were in the provinces of upper and lower South and in Bangkok and vicinity. The instruments used were a questionnaire and an interview form. The frequency, percentage, means and standard deviation were used to analyze the quantitative data. The content analysis was used to analyze the qualitative data. The research findings were as follows: The superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of the graduates was high with respect to basic attributes ( $\bar{X} = 3.92$ ), social attributes ( $\bar{X} = 4.08$ ), professional attributes ( $\bar{X} = 4.01$ ), and emotional-quotient attributes ( $\bar{X} = 3.97$ ). The overall superiors' satisfaction was at the high level ( $\bar{X} = 4.00$ ). The highest attributes as suggested for improvement of graduates were as follows: The basic attribute was the desirability for enhancement of enthusiasm. The social attribute was to be open-minded to others' ideas. The professional attribute was to be fully devoted to one's duties. The emotional-quotient attribute was the desirability for greater self-control of emotion. The suggestions are that the university should use the results of research findings as ways to improve curricula and various projects of student development to prepare more-efficient graduates who will better meet the requirements of the job market.

**Keywords:** efficiency of work performance, graduates of Prince of Songkla University, satisfaction, superiors

## Introduction

Prince of Songkla University is the first university of the southern region. It was founded for the first time in Rusamilae Village, Muang (Principal) District, Pattani Province, in 1966. At the beginning it went under the name "University of Southern Thailand." Later in September 1967 it was graciously given the name "Prince of Songkhla University" by His Majesty the King after His Royal Father, Prince Mahidol of Songkla (*Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus: Histor, 2004, online*). It started to offer classes to students in 1967 and has continued doing so until today. The vision of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, is to be an institution of higher learning devoted to the creation of bodies of knowledge and the application of technologies for guidance and development of society, local, national, as well as international by the year 2012 (*Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus: Vision and Mission, 2004, online*).

From the year 1967 to the present Prince of Songkla University has produced manpower into the labor market on a grand scale. The decision-making by administrators at the higher education level on the process of educational planning and administration to achieve production of manpower in fields and on educational levels with goal-oriented efficiency and effectiveness must rely on accurate and adequate data responsive to turns of events, in particular with respect to resource utilization, organization of activities, and expenditure management. Another important point to be considered in matters of instruction and curriculum in a university is the emphasis on a system of

assessment of quality of graduates, which is a major indicator of efficiency in the assessment of quality of a university. A university's assessment of quality of graduates thus provides information of extreme importance for decision-making. It is also a means of searching for a guideline for policy planning and determination for development of the university's quality curriculum and instructional system in a desired direction. The syllabus for every field has been revised in conformance with each faculty's standard: the revision is to take place at least every five years (Ministry of University Affairs, 1999, 8). The attributes specified for each program must correspond to the needs of either the society or product consumers, with the aim of developing knowledge and ability to the fullest potential along with adequate skills and desirable attributes as characterized by devotion to knowledge and learning, adherence to discipline, and application of merits in coexistence with others in society (*Office of the National Education Commission, 1999, 2*). From the 3/1996 meeting of the Steering Committee on Educational Quality Assurance, Prince of Songkla University, on May 24, 1996, and the first (1/1996) meeting of the Academic Council on August 20, 1996, approval was granted of the specification of three areas of graduates' attributes, namely, basic skills, professional competency, and social competency.

The research carried out at Prince of Songkla University on the assessment of quality of graduates was done by Chaluay Cheewakidakarn and others (1997, *Abstract*). It studied the quality of Prince of Songkla University graduates as perceived by employers or superiors, with the objectives of

studying the quality of graduates of the University by assessing the graduates' work performance in the opinions of employers or superiors, and of studying desirable attributes of graduates as seen by employers or superiors. The method of study was both quantitative and qualitative, the quantitative being of primary importance. It was found that the work performance by graduates was assessed as good for all 14 factors. Regarding the graduates' 15 attributes as desired by employers and superiors, it was found that 10 attributes of graduates most desired by private, government, and state enterprise agencies were responsibility in work performance, enthusiasm in work performance, diligence and perseverance in work performance, knowledge and ability for useful application of knowledge, analytical and problem-solving knowledge and ability, human relations, specialized knowledge and ability, self-confidence, ability to transmit knowledge, and leadership. Five attributes were desired at a moderate level: special computer knowledge and ability, special foreign-language knowledge and ability, special administrative knowledge and ability, experience in activity participation while student, and special knowledge and ability regarding relevant laws and regulations.

Prince of Songkla University (2004, Abstract) conducted a research on the satisfaction of employers/consumers of its graduates of the class of the 2002 academic year with the objectives of studying levels of the said satisfaction concerning academic/professional knowledge and ability, general knowledge and ability, personality, and merits, ethics, and professional code of conduct, and of comparing the satisfaction of employers/

consumers in the state sector with that employers/consumers in the private sector in terms of groups of fields of study. The method of study was survey research. The sample consisted of 1,837 employers/consumers of the employed graduates of the class of the 2002 academic year. The data collection was based on the addresses of the employers/consumers. From the questionnaire responses on the conditions of job search involving all the employed graduates, it was found that as a whole the employers/consumers were satisfied at a high level with the following attributes: academic/professional knowledge and ability, general knowledge and ability, personality, and merits, ethics, and professional code of conduct. The satisfaction was at a high level with all nine items of academic/professional knowledge and ability, with the first three ranks of satisfaction at a high level being knowledge of work under responsibility, ability in further search for knowledge for work development, and ability to apply professional knowledge to assigned tasks. Comparatively in terms of the employers/consumers in the state sector versus those in the private sector, the following findings obtained. For the health science group, there were item differences in satisfaction between the two sectors with respect to professional expertise and ability in problem-solving decision-making on work under responsibility. For the science and technology group, differences in satisfaction were found by item between the two sectors regarding professional knowledge and ability and general academic knowledge. And for the social science group, there were differences in satisfaction by item between the two sectors with reference to professional knowledge and

ability. The satisfaction of the employers/consumers with the aspect of general knowledge and ability was at a high level, with nine items evoking satisfaction at a high level, of which the first three items of the most satisfaction were discipline in work, ability to adjust to work system, and ability in teamwork. Comparatively by the two sectors, differences in means of satisfaction were found for each group of disciplines as follows. For the health science group, there were differences in satisfaction by item between the two sectors concerning ability to use information technology, initiative and creativity, ability in analysis and synthesis, ability in administration, and ability to use English. For the science and technology group, differences existed by item for all items in the satisfaction between the two sectors regarding ability to use information technology and ability in analysis and synthesis. And for the social science group, no difference was found for any items in the satisfaction between the two sectors. As a whole, the satisfaction was at a high level for all eight items, with the first three items of the most satisfaction being cooperation with coworkers, adjustment to coworkers, and human relations. Comparatively in regard to the two sectors, the following were found between means of satisfaction. For the health science group, there were differences by item between the two sectors with reference to cooperation with coworkers, tolerance of others' opinions, self-confidence, reasonableness, leadership, and ability to control temper. For the science and technology group, differences were found in the satisfaction between the two sectors regarding cooperation with coworkers, tolerance of others' opinions, reasonableness, and

ability to control temper. And for the social science group, no difference was found by item in the satisfaction between the two sectors. As for the satisfaction of the employers/consumers with respect to merits, ethics, and professional code of conduct, it was at the highest level as a whole, with five items of the highest satisfaction and two of high satisfaction, the first three items of the highest satisfaction being honesty, moral conduct, and ability to live with others happily. Comparatively in terms of the state sector versus the private sector, differences in the means of satisfaction for each discipline group were found to be the following. For the health science group and the science and technology group, differences by item in the satisfaction between the two sectors had to do with diligence and perseverance. And for the social science group, no difference was found for any items in the satisfaction between the two sectors.

In addition, there were other research pieces conducted by other agencies. The Policy and Plan Unit of the Planning and Development Division, Yonok College (2002, *Abstract*) undertook a research on the satisfaction of employers with graduates of Yonok College for the 2000 academic year. The aim of the research was to know the factors that made entrepreneurs decide to choose graduates of Yonok College as workers in their establishments, and to know how much these graduates understood roles, functions, and types of work, as well as to know the satisfaction of employers/entrepreneurs with the graduates regarding their skills, competencies, and work performances. From the research survey, it was found that the factor most influential in the choice of the

graduates by employers/entrepreneurs was the correspondence between fields of study and job positions to be filled, at 63.2 per cent. Next in line were friendly disposition and good human relations, at 49.1 per cent, and initiative and creativity as well as intelligence and quick thinking, at 47.4 per cent. Sukalya Dhammaraksa (1998, Abstract) did a research entitled *The Conditions of Employment, the Working Conditions, and the Satisfaction of Employers Involving Graduates of the Faculty of Science, Thai Chamber of Commerce University*, and in sum the research findings were as follows. As a whole, the employers were satisfied at a good level with the graduates concerning the aspect of knowledge and ability and of the general aspect. And most of the employers gave equal emphasis to knowledge and ability for work performance and general ability.

From the research findings already referred to, the assessment of the satisfaction of employers/consumers with Prince of Songkla University graduates involved graduates of all the campuses collectively, without focusing on any one campus in particular. Therefore, the researcher was interested to know the quality of graduates through a study of the satisfaction of superiors with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of only the Pattani Campus of Prince of Songkla University. For this assessment, the criteria were the desirable attributes of graduates as laid down by Prince of Songkla University to be used as a guideline for assessment of the quality of graduates in three areas: basic skills, professional competency, and social competency. However, there was one other area of attributes that the

researcher thought should be assessed in addition to the three abovementioned areas: emotional-quotient area, as emotional quotient is important for livelihood, be it life of work, personal life, or family and social life. A person with good emotional quotient can live in the world of work today better than one high in intelligence quotient but low in emotional quotient. The researcher also intended to put together suggestions from graduates' superiors for use in determining a guideline for further development of the quality of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus.

#### **Research Objectives**

To conduct the research entitled *The Superiors' Satisfaction with the Efficiency of Work Performance of Graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus*, the researcher set the following research objectives:

1. To study the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, and
2. To put together suggestions from graduates' superiors for use in quality development of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus.

#### **Research Methodology**

The principal objective of this research was to study the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, by means of descriptive research with the following details of the research procedure.

### Target Population

The target population consisted of all superiors of graduates for the 2001–2002 academic years of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus. The superiors' workplaces were located in the provinces of upper and lower southern region as well as in Bangkok and vicinity.

### Accessible Population

The accessible population consisted of 222 superiors of graduates for the 2001–2002 academic years of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus. The superiors' workplaces were located in the provinces of upper and lower southern region and in Bangkok and vicinity, with the following details of selection.

1. Checking the names and addresses of graduates for the 2001–2002 academic years of Prince of Songkhla University at the Registration Office of the University.

2. Inquiring about graduates' places of work by sending copies of a questionnaire to the addresses of graduates whose domiciles were in the provinces of Pattani, Yala, Narathiwat, Songkhla, Satoon, and in Bangkok and vicinity. The researcher sent the questionnaire copies by post with stamped envelopes addressed to the researcher. The graduates were requested to return the completed questionnaire to the researcher by post.

3. Recording all graduates' workplaces or organizations of jurisdiction located in the provinces of upper and lower southern region and in Bangkok and vicinity.

### Sample

The sample consisted of 127 superiors in the total accessible population.

### Research Instruments

The data-gathering instruments of the research were the following.

1. Questionnaire consisting of three sections as follows.

**Section 1** was a questionnaire on the respondent's basic data in the manner of checklist inquiring about gender, age, educational qualification, position, experience as superior, and location.

**Section 2** was a rating-scale questionnaire on the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, made up of 115 questions as categorized below.

- 1) Basic attributes 18 questions
- 2) Social attributes 29 questions
- 3) Professional attributes 23 questions
- 4) Emotional-quotient attributes 19 questions

The criterion of response choices involved five levels scoring 5, 4, 3, 2 and 1, signifying satisfaction at highest level, high level, moderate level, low level, and lowest level, respectively.

**Section 3** involved collection of suggestions from graduates' superiors to serve in the development of the quality of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus.

2. **Interview Form** consisting of broad questions as categorized below.

- 1) Basic attributes 3 questions
- 2) Social attributes 2 questions
- 3) Professional attributes 3 questions
- 4) Emotional-quotient attributes 2 questions



Besides the above categories, the interviewee could express other opinions on the efficiency of work performance of graduates.

In order to evaluate the construct validity of the questionnaire, five experts were assigned to do the evaluation. The  $\alpha$  - coefficient of .95 was obtained for the reliability of the questionnaire from a trial with 10 superiors who were not samples in the study.

#### Data Collection

For the data collection by questionnaire, the researcher sent questionnaire copies to all of the sample by post along with stamped envelopes addressed to the researcher so that the subjects could return the questionnaire also by post. For the data collection by interview, the researcher made contact by telephone or direct approach, explaining the objectives of the research and then making an appointment for ensuing interview.

#### Data Analysis

The frequency, percentage, means and standard deviation were used to analyze the quantitative data. The content analysis was used to analyze the qualitative data.

### Results

#### 1. Outcome of the analysis of the data from the questionnaire.

From the 226 copies of the questionnaire sent out, 127 were returned, at 57.21 per cent. The outcome of the analysis of the data from the questionnaire was detailed as follows.

**Section 1** The outcome of the analysis of the statuses of superiors of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus.

It was founded that most of the graduates' superiors who responded to the questionnaire were male, at 62.20 per cent, aged 41-50 years, at 35.43, and mostly graduates with bachelor's degree, at 54.33. Most of the superiors' positions were directors of educational institutions, at 37.80. Most had the experience as superiors of less than 10 years, at 62.99. And the workplaces of most were located in lower southern region: Nakorn-srithammaraj, Pattalung, Songkhla, Satoon, Pattani, and Yala, at 89.76.

**Section 2** The outcome of the study of the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus by mean questionnaire.

From the data collection by questionnaire, it was found that the analysis of the data regarding the said satisfaction yielded the following.

#### 1) Basic Attributes

The outcome of the study of basic attributes from the questionnaire responses from 127 superiors involving 18 items appears in Table 1

Table 1 shows that the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning basic attributes was at a high level by total average. Considered by item, it was found that every item was rated at a high level, that the ability in listening, speaking, reading, and writing in Thai rated the highest mean ( $\bar{x} = 4.27$ ), and that the ability to use computer-package programs rated the lowest mean ( $\bar{x} = 3.71$ ).

#### 2) Social Attributes

The outcome of the study of social attributes from the questionnaire responses from 127

**Table 1 The arithmetic-mean and standard-deviation values of the satisfaction of superiors with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning basic attributes. (n = 127)**

Statement	$\bar{X}$	S.D.	Interpretation
<b>Possession of learning skills</b>			
1. Quick to learn	4.02	0.80	High
2. Interested in learning	4.16	1.00	High
3. Own search for knowledge and facts	3.86	.86	High
4. Diligence and enthusiasm in search for knowledge	3.98	.86	High
5. Perseverance in pursuit of knowledge	3.83	.86	High
6. Possessing listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills for Thai.	4.27	.82	High
7. Capable of summary in Thai	4.19	.84	High
8. Capable of message transmission in Thai	4.12	.99	High
<b>Possession of skills in computer and information technology</b>			
9. Able to use computer-package programs	3.71	.98	High
10. Able to effect data treatment by computer	3.72	1.18	High
11. Quick thinking in solving emergency problems	3.85	1.04	High
12. Able to solve problems in work	3.83	1.02	High
13. Vision in work performance	3.90	.86	High
14. Upholding standard in work performance	3.85	1.02	High
15. Able to apply timely data to implementation planning	3.80	1.09	High
16. Systematic planning	3.76	1.07	High
17. Able to effect coordination with individuals/agencies concerned	3.83	.91	High
18. Able to delegate tasks to appropriate individuals	3.81	1.00	High
<b>Total</b>	<b>3.92</b>	<b>.70</b>	<b>High</b>

superiors with 29 items appears in Table 2.

Table 2 shows that the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning social attributes was by total mean at a high level. When considered by individual items, it was found that the avoidance of addictions and vices was at the highest level ( $\bar{x} = 4.52$ ), while at the lowest level were the ability to temper emotional expressions effectively and the ability to effect compromise ( $\bar{x} = 3.82$ ).

### 3) The outcome of the study of professional attributes

The outcome of the study of professional attributes from the questionnaire responses of 127 superiors appears in Table 3.

Table 3 shows that the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkhla University, Pattani Campus, concerning professional attributes was at a high level by collective average. Individually, it was found that all items were at a high level. The

**Table 2 The arithmetic-mean and standard-deviation values of the satisfaction of superiors with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning social attributes. (n = 127)**

Statement	$\bar{X}$	S.D.	Interpretation
<b>Disciplined and compliant with social rules</b>			
1. Punctual	4.00	.80	High
2. Proper in conduct	4.13	.69	High
3. Respectful of others' rights	4.13	.70	High
4. Having a sense of right and wrong	4.11	.73	High
5. Compliant with regulations and rules of organizations and society	4.22	1.14	High
Having a sense of responsibility			
6. Accepting consequences of work performance	4.05	.95	High
7. Willing to accept tasks assigned in line of duty	4.10	.74	High
8. Knowing own role and function in organization and society	4.14	.91	High
9. Developing self to be capable of performance appropriate to role function	4.09	1.05	High
<b>Able to coexist with others happily</b>			
10. Placing common interest above self-interest	3.89	.79	High
11. Possessing suitable personality	4.02	.68	High
12. Possessing suitable degree of maturity	3.97	.68	High
13. Having optimistic outlook	3.97	.76	High
14. Able to temper emotional expressions effectively	3.82	.81	High
15. Accepting rules and regulations	4.16	.75	High
16. Being good as leader as well as follower	4.00	.83	High
17. Capable of self-adjustment to society	4.10	.82	High
18. Listening to others' reasons and explanations	4.00	.76	High
19. Extending to others cooperation, assistance, and generosity	4.14	.77	High
20. Thinking and acting reasonably	4.02	.67	High
21. Able to effect compromise	3.82	.79	High
22. Able to give advice	3.87	.88	High
<b>Being infused with merits and ethics</b>			
23. Capable of sacrifice for others	3.95	.84	High
24. Being just	4.09	1.08	High
25. Capable of forgiving	4.01	.87	High
26. Being honest	4.21	.85	High
27. Exemplary conduct	4.05	.87	High
28. Not taking to addictives and vices	4.52	1.10	Highest
29. Being ashamed and afraid of sin	4.27	.88	High
<b>Total</b>	<b>4.08</b>	<b>.60</b>	<b>High</b>

**Table 3 The arithmetic-mean and standard-deviation values of the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning professional attributes. (n = 127)**

Statement	$\bar{X}$	S.D.	Interpretation
<b>Output</b>			
1. Able to do quality standard work	3.94	.80	High
2. Able to complete set amount of work	3.94	.86	High
3. Able to complete work on time	3.90	.87	High
4. Able to follow step-by-step procedure of work performance	4.01	.85	High
5. Able to give successful work performance and gain general acceptance	3.95	.92	High
<b>Thorough Professional Knowledge</b>			
6. Being professionally skilled	3.93	.85	High
7. Profound and true professional knowledge	3.88	.96	High
8. Having interest in and keeping up with new professional developments	3.87	.91	High
9. Having basic professional knowledge as practiced	3.98	1.09	High
<b>Ability to transmit professional knowledge</b>			
10. Capable of problem solving by means of suitable process	3.78	.85	High
11. Able to apply professional knowledge to problem solving in work	3.85	.85	High
12. Able to apply knowledge acquired from study to work development	3.87	.88	High
13. Able to recognize new developments in work and bring them about	3.92	.88	High
14. Application of knowledge and technology to benefit organization and society appropriately	3.84	.99	High
<b>Awareness of and Interest in Development of Organization and Environment</b>			
15. Acceptance of the process of internal and external auditing	4.00	.82	High
16. Participation in and acceptance of activities in support of organizational development	4.22	1.10	High
17. Participation in and acceptance of activities in support of environmental development	4.03	1.00	High
<b>Adherence to Professional Code of Conduct</b>			
18. Protect secrets of the organization	4.20	1.10	High
19. Upholding work and professional standards	4.15	.92	High
20. Maintaining positive attitude toward the profession	4.18	.81	High
21. Attention to work at hand	4.22	.84	High
22. Able to recognize and maintain safety in the course of work	4.11	.90	High
23. Awareness of and interest in possible impacts on society and environment of the practice of the profession	3.97	.87	High
<b>Total</b>	<b>4.01</b>	<b>.68</b>	<b>High</b>

items found to be with the highest mean ( $\bar{X} = 4.22$ ) were participation in and acceptance of activities in support of organizational development, and attention to work at hand, while the item with the lowest mean ( $\bar{X} = 3.78$ ) was ability in problem solving by means of suitable process.

#### 4) Emotional-Quotient Attributes

The outcome of the study of emotional-quotient attributes from the responses of 127 superiors with 19 items appears in Table 4.

Table 4 shows that the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates

of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning emotional-quotient attributes was at a high level by collective average. Individually, it was found that every item was at a high level. The item found to be with the highest mean ( $\bar{X} = 4.13$ ) was realizing the value of and recognizing self-dignity, and the item with the lowest mean ( $\bar{X} = 3.78$ ) was being skilled in stress reduction.

Table 5 shows that the outcome of the study of the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, as a whole

**Table 4 The arithmetic-mean and standard-deviation values of the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning emotional-quotient attributes. (n = 127)**

Statement	$\bar{X}$	S.D.	Interpretation
<b>Emotion and Feeling</b>			
1. Able to control temper in the face of problem	3.83	.90	High
2. Recognizing others' feelings	4.02	.88	High
3. Able to show emotion appropriately in front of others	3.87	.87	High
4. Capable of mental and emotional self-development	3.93	.88	High
5. Having a sense of humor	3.87	.94	High
6. Optimistic view of the world	4.04	.90	High
7. Being skilled in stress reduction	3.78	.92	High
8. Knowing and understanding self and others	3.98	.84	High
9. Sympathizing with others	4.02	.85	High
10. Being broadminded and tolerant of others' ideas	3.98	.94	High
11. Acceptance of mistakes by self and others	3.91	1.03	High
12. Able to put up with circumstances and tolerate them	3.83	.73	High
13. Cheering up self and others	4.01	.72	High
14. Able to face realities	4.00	.96	High
15. Leading a life of principle	3.94	.65	High
16. Being self-confident	4.12	.68	High
17. Honoring others	4.07	.75	High
18. Realizing the value of and recognizing self-dignity	4.13	.67	High
19. Learning to commend others for their success	4.05	.78	High
<b>Total</b>	<b>3.97</b>	<b>.64</b>	<b>High</b>

**Table 5 The outcome of the study of the superiors' collective satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkhla University, Pattani Campus. (n = 127)**

Category	$\bar{X}$	S.D.	Interpretation
Basic attributes	3.92	.70	High
Social attributes	4.08	.60	High
Professional attributes	4.01	.68	High
Emotional-quotient attributes	3.97	.66	High
<b>Total</b>	<b>4.00</b>	<b>.66</b>	<b>High</b>

was at a high level. When considered by individual attributes, it was found that the social attributes were the highest in mean ( $\bar{X} = 4.08$ ), and that the basic attributes were the lowest in mean ( $\bar{X} = 3.92$ ).

## 2. The outcome of the study by interview of the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus.

From the data collection by interview involving 10 superiors on the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, concerning the four categories of attributes as mentioned above, it was found that the superiors perceived the efficiency of work performance in those categories as follows.

**1) Basic Attributes.** The graduates referred to were enthusiastic, interested, and curious, as well as searched for knowledge on their own, at a high level. Their analytical and synthetical thinking was at a moderate level. Their knowledge and ability regarding the use of information for data search and communication was at a high level.

**2) Social Attributes.** The graduates referred to had the ability to adjust to social and environmental changes at a high level, and their generosity

and sense of common interest above self-interest were at a high level.

**3) Professional Attributes.** The graduates referred to applied the knowledge in their fields of study to their jobs at a high level. Their development of new knowledge toward excellence on their jobs was at a high level. Their specialized professional skills and their ability to integrate knowledge to benefit their work were at a high level.

**4) Emotional-Quotient Attributes.** The graduates referred to were self-confident and were able to solve problems by themselves at a high level. Their ability in emotional self-management was at a high level.

## Findings and Discussion

The research on the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, yielded results of data analysis worthy of discussion as follows.

1. The results of the study of the superiors' satisfaction with the efficiency of work performance of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, were at a high level, corresponding to the research outcome of Prince of Songkla University (2004, *Abstract*) in the study of the satisfaction of employers/consumers of graduates of the 2002

academic year of the University, in which it was found that the satisfaction of employers/consumers of graduates was at a high level with the following attributes: academic/professional knowledge and competency, general knowledge and ability, personality, and merits, ethics, and professional code of conduct. Chaluy Cheewakidakarn and others (1997, *Abstract*), in the study of the quality of graduates of Prince of Songkla University as perceived by employers or superiors, found that the quality of graduates, from the assessment of work performance by graduates through quantitative study, was assessed by employers or superiors to be good on all 14 factors. In addition, Aree Khanawiwachai and Malee Hung-sapruek (2003, *Abstract*), in the study of the satisfaction of employers/consumers of graduates of Prince of Songkla University, found the satisfaction of employers/consumers of graduates to be as follows: academic/professional knowledge and competency at a moderate level, with general knowledge and ability, personality, and professional merits and ethics at a high level. Suwaiba Sama-ae (2004, *Abstract*), in the study of desirable attributes of master's degree graduates of the Faculty of Education, Prince of Songkla University, as perceived by superiors, found desirable attributes to be basic attributes, academic/professional attributes, social attributes, and emotional-quotient attributes. And from interviews and questionnaire responses involving graduates' superiors, most felt that all the four categories of attributes were at a high level. Besides, there were other pieces of research undertaken apart from those carried out by Prince of Songkla University. Porntip Apinuntaporn (1992, *Abstract*)

monitored Master of Education graduates in Non-formal Education of the Faculty of Education, Chulalongkorn University, and found the efficiency of work performance of the graduates as perceived by themselves, superiors, and coworkers to be satisfactory at a high level as a whole for all the groups. Sukalaya Dhammaraksa (1999, *Abstract*), who studied the state of employment and work performance of graduates and the employers' satisfaction with graduates of the Faculty of Science, Thai Chamber of Commerce University, found that as a whole the employers' satisfaction with the graduates was good with respect to the aspect of knowledge and ability and the general aspect. Besides, Buapun Kamnoetsing (1998, *Abstract*) monitored the work performance of master's degree graduates of the Department of Library Science and Information Science, Mahasarakham University, of the 1984-1995 academic years to study their work performance as perceived by their superiors, and found that most of the superiors felt that the graduates' performance was at a high level. And Wantanee Buankeeyapun (1995, *Abstract*), who followed up the performance of master's degree graduates in the teaching of English at Kasetsart University who taught at secondary education level focusing on the performance as perceived by the graduates themselves, their superiors, and their coworkers, and found the graduates' competency was at a high level in every aspect.

As indicated by research, the fact that the graduates of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, with four faculties: Education, Science and Technology, Humanities and Social Sciences, and the College of Islamic Studies, demonstrated

work-performance efficiency or readiness in every aspect was probably due to the curriculum structure that put emphasis on general education courses, specialty courses, and free elective courses. Throughout every program, no fewer than 140 credits were required, with foremost emphasis on general education followed by specialty courses and free elective courses. The specialty courses included core courses, major courses, and minor courses. Because of this, the graduates were perceived to possess good work performance knowledge and ability. As for special knowledge and ability, this might come from the fact that the curriculum structure required graduates to do either work practicum or teaching practicum and to participate in activities, including programs of continuous development of students while in attendance at Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus. The graduates thus gained further knowledge and ability apart from what came to them in the classroom, resulting in their acquisition of all the more knowledge and experience. This was in keeping with the National Plan of Education (2002–2016), of which the intent is for complete human development in body, mind, intelligence, knowledge, and merits with ethics and culture in the conduct of life, the kind of development to enable one to achieve happy coexistence with others and to make the Thai society strong with a three-way balance as a society of quality, wisdom and learning, and harmony and mutual care (*Ministry of University Affairs, 1999*), in keeping with the attributes of the ideal graduate as graduate of the public endowed with knowledge and merits in concert.

2. The collection of suggestions from the graduates' superiors for development of the quality of graduates of Prince of Songkhla University, Pattani Campus.

The research findings indicated the following. The superiors wanted to develop the quality of graduates in these areas. For basic attributes, the suggestion with the highest frequency, at 23.53 per cent, was enhancement of enthusiasm. For social attributes, the suggestion with the highest frequency, at 20.00 per cent, was being broadminded and accepting others' ideas. For professional attributes, the suggestion with the highest frequency, 33.34 per cent, was attention to duty to the best of ability. And for emotional-quotient attributes, the suggestion with the highest frequency, at 68.18 per cent, was more self-control of emotion.

The attributes that the superiors wanted to have developed corresponded to what was in the research by Athorn Chandawimon (*1988, 5, cited in Rutara Klomchoom, 1990, 10*), which stated that the quality labor desired by entrepreneurs was characterized by several attributes including diligence, enthusiasm, and not being without human relations. Ploenpit Saeng-in (*1979, 20*) stated that the attributes of one desired by entrepreneurs included attention to work, constant attendance at work and taking responsibility for assigned work, efficiency at work, and perseverance and industry. Sermsak Wisalaporn and others (*1993, 96*) stated that occupational attributes desired by entrepreneurs included human relations, diligence, and perseverance. Dubin (*1976, 412*) proposed principles of human relations among which were tolerance of others' ideas, perseverance, and emotional stability.



Mullika Nitayaporn and Arunsri Anantarawichai (1991, cited in the *Department of Vocational Education, Ministry of Education, 1992, 29*) studied ideas of those entering the labor market and made the following conclusion: conducting self so as to be successful in work, with secondary attributes being human relations, knowing one's duty, and interest in as well as understanding of work. It can thus be seen that several qualities are needed together for work performance to enable graduates to achieve work-performance quality at a high level in keeping with the demand of the labor market.

### Suggestions

#### 1. Suggestions for application.

1.1 For application as guidelines for development of curriculum and instruction and projects for student development in various forms in accordance with the policy of Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, keeping with the demands of organizations and society.

1.2 To serve as basic data to complement decision-making and guide development planning as well as to improve the process of production of graduates of the University in accordance with the demands of the present society so as to be increasingly acceptable to the labor market.

#### 2. Suggestions for further research.

2.1 Assessments should be made of the work-performance efficiency of graduates of other Faculties and their results compared for further development of products of Prince of Songkla University.

2.2 Every graduate of Prince of Songkla University should be assessed for work-performance efficiency, with an annual assessment to be made continuously year after year.

2.3 Besides superiors, coworkers and graduates themselves should take part in the assessment of graduates' work-performance efficiency.

### References

- Aree Khanawatwichai and Malee Hungsapruak. 2003. **Research Report on the Satisfaction of Employers/Consumers of Graduates of Prince of Songkla University.** Songkhla: Prince of Songkla University.
- Best, John W. (1970). **Research in Education.** New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Buapun Kamnoetsing. (1998). **The Follow-Up of the Work Performance by Master's Degree Graduates of the Department of Library Science and Information.** Science, Mahasarakham University, of the 1984-1995 Academic Years. Master's Thesis in Liberal Arts (Library Science and Information Science), Mahasarakham University. (Copy)
- Bunchom Srisard. (1992). **Introduction to Research.** (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Bangkok: Suweeriyasan.
- Buntam Kitpreedaborisut. (1999). **Techniques of Construction of Data-Gatherin Instruments For Research.** (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Bangkok: B & B Publishing.
- Chaluay Cheewakidakarn and others. (1997). **Research Report on the Quality of Graduates of Prince of Songkla University as Perceived by Employers/Superiors.** Songkhla: Prince of Songkla University.

- Cronbach, Lee J. (1990). **Essentials of Psychological Testing**. (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). New York: Harper and Row.
- Department of Vocational Education. (2000). The Ideas of Those Entering the Labor Market on Educational, Economic, and Social Development in Thailand. **Journal of Vocational Education Research**, 2 (April–June), 29.
- Dubin, Robert. (1976). **Human Relations in Administration**. New Jersey: Prentice–Hall.
- Evans, James R., and David L. Olson. (2003). **Statistics, Data Analysis, and Decision Modeling**. New Jersey: Prentice–Hall.
- Ministry of University Affairs. (1999). **Manual of Quality Assurance for Universities and Higher Education Institutions**. Bangkok: Office of Higher Education Standards.
- Ploenpit Saeng – in. (1979). **Student Manual**. Bangkok: s.n.
- Policy and Plan Unit, Planning and Development Division, Yonok College. (2002). **Research Report on the Employers' Satisfaction with the Work Performance by Graduates of Yonok College, the 2000 Academic Year**. Lampang: Yonok College.
- \_\_\_\_\_. (2004). **Vision and Mission**. (Online) Available: <http://mis-pattani2.pn.psu.ac.th/intranet/about/vision.php>. Accessed (15 August, 2004).
- Porntip Apinuntaporn. (1992). **The Follow-Up of Master of Education Graduates in Non-Formal Education, the Faculty of Education, Chulalongkorn University**. Master's Thesis in Education (Non-Formal Education), Graduate College, Chulalongkorn University. (Copy)
- Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus. (2004). **History**. (Online). Available: <http://mis-pattani2.pn.psu.ac.th/intranet/about/history.php>. Accessed (15 August, 2004).
- Prince of Songkla University. (2004). **Research Report on the Satisfaction of Employers/Consumers of Graduates of Prince of Songkla University of the 2002 Academic Year**. Songkhla: Prince of Songkla University.
- Puangrat Taweerat. (1995). **Research Methods in Behavioral Science and Social Science**. (6<sup>th</sup>ed.). Bangkok: Chulalongkorn University Book Center.
- Rutara Klomchoom. (1990). **Research Report on the Follow-Up of Employment of Graduates of Technical Colleges in the Northeast**. Nongkhai: Nongkhai Technical College.
- Sermasak Wisalaporn. (1993). **Educational Leaders' Behaviors**. Bangkok: Thai Wattana Panich.
- Sueksasichana Maneepun and others. (2001). **Research Report on the Assessment of Consumers of Graduates of Phuket Rajabhat Institute**. Phuket: Phuket Rajabhat Institute.
- Sukalaya Dhammaraksa. (1998). The State of Employment and Work Performance of Graduates and the Employers' Satisfaction with Graduates of the Faculty of Science, Thai Chamber of Commerce University. (2000). **Academic Journal of Thai Chamber of Commerce University**, 3 (September–December).
- Suwaiba Sama-ae. (2004). **The Assessment of Desirable Attributes of Master's Degree Graduates, Faculty of Education, Prince of Songkla University, as Perceived by Superiors**.” Master

- of Education Thesis, Prince of Songkla University. (Copy)
- The National Education Commission, Office of. (1999). **The National Plans of Education (2002-2016)**. Bangkok: Prikwan Graphics Company, Limited.
- Wanta Tuakhantee. (1997). **The Work-Performance Follow-Up of Master's Degree Graduates in Industrial Studies, Faculty of Education, Srinakharinwirot University, of the 1991-1996 Academic Years**. Master's Thesis in Education (Industry). Srinakharinwirot University, Prasarnmitr. (Copy)
- Wantanee Buankeeyapun. (1995). **The Work-Performance Follow-Up of Master of Arts Graduates in the Teaching of English**, Master's Thesis. Kasetsart University. (Copy)

